

WITCHCRAFT MYTHOLOGIES AND PERSECUTIONS

Demons, Spirits, Witches

Series Editors

GÁBOR KLANICZAY and ÉVA PÓCS

Volume III

WITCHCRAFT MYTHOLOGIES AND PERSECUTIONS

Edited by

Gábor Klaniczay and Éva Pócs

in collaboration with Eszter Csonka-Takács



Central European University Press
Budapest • New York

©2008 by Gábor Klaniczay and Éva Pócs

Published in 2008 by

Central European University Press
An imprint of the
Central European University Share Company
Nádor utca 11, H-1051 Budapest, Hungary
Tel: +36-1-327-3138 or 327-3000
Fax: +36-1-327-3183
E-mail: ceupress@ceu.hu
Website: www.ceupress.com

400 West 59th Street, New York NY 10019, USA
Tel: +1-212-547-6932
Fax: +1-646-557-2416
E-mail: mgreenwald@sorosny.org

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced,
stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted,
in any form or by any means, without the permission
of the Publisher.

ISBN 978-963-7326-87-5 cloth

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Witchcraft mythologies and persecutions / edited by Éva Pócs and Gábor Klaniczay.
p. cm. -- (Demons, spirits, witches ; vol. 3)
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-9637326875 (cloth : alk. paper) 1. Witchcraft. I. Pócs, Éva. II. Klaniczay,
Gábor. III. Title. IV. Series.

BF1566.W7393 2008
133.4'309--dc22

2008008267

Printed in Hungary

LEARNED SYSTEMS AND POPULAR NARRATIVES OF VISION AND BEWITCHMENT

GÁBOR KLANICZAY

The two phenomena contained in the title, vision and bewitchment, are different by nature. Visionary experience represents a specific type of contact with the supernatural, when heavenly or diabolic forces make an intrusion into the everyday life of humans, and convey their messages to them in a form visible and audible by their perceptive organs, or ravish them with their own supernatural world for a while, providing them with amazing experiences (Benz 1969; Dinzelbacher 1981; Christian 1998). Bewitchment is, according to the explanatory system of witchcraft beliefs, the misfortune caused by the malevolent activity of witches, a kind of negative miracle brought about by their evil supernatural power (Evans-Pritchard 1980; Klaniczay 1997). The link between the two is provided by the fact that while visions and apparitions are generally understood as a sensory experience of the presence of some divine or holy beings (in Christianity God, the Virgin Mary, Jesus, angels, or the saints), which frequently have miraculous effects, bewitchments are also often attributed to the consequence of the nightly apparition of witches. Sometimes this is just a spooky nightly aggression, the witch “pressing,” physically injuring the victim, coming to see him in a metamorphosed animal shape. There are, however, also other occasions when witches or demons take the victim to the enchanted world of the witches’ Sabbath. In such cases, the bewitchment is the aftermath of a real diabolic vision. This second type could be, justifiably, put in relation with the mainstream of visionary experience in Latin Christianity, especially with the cases in which mystics are tempted and tortured by devils, or with the mass of less elaborate visions: the apparitions of saints in dreams or visions included into medieval miracle accounts (Goodich 2007).

In my present study, I propose to examine the relationship of these two categories in three documentary clusters, taken from three different chronological segments of medieval and early modern Christianity: one from thirteenth-century Germany and Italy; one from fifteenth-century Switzerland and France; and the third from seventeenth and eighteenth-century Hungary. The first one relates to the thirteenth-century transformations of the cult of the saints, the rise of the ideal of the “living saint.” The second one would take us into the context of late medieval doubts, to the moment when the high profile of visionary sainthood was challenged, and the critically dissected visions were increasingly assimilated to diabolic delusions, and to the world of witchcraft. The third one, finally, is confronting more or less visionary type descriptions on the witches’ Sabbath. Besides highlighting three stages of a plurisecular transformation process of medieval and early modern Christianity, what these cases have in common is that they all represent a combination of “popular” beliefs documented by narratives recorded in judicial context and learned systems framing this “raw material” into new explanatory systems.¹

From Experience to Fable, from Simple to Complex Form

My first group of examples is taken from the canonization process of St. Elizabeth of Hungary, the pious Hungarian princess, who died in Marburg as the widow of the Thuringian landgrave, on 19 November 1231 (*Sankt Elisabeth* 1981; Klaniczay 2002, pp. 195–251). What is interesting about her hagiographic documentation is that it had been collected in the framework of a new type of procedure, a canonization process, introduced and developed by Popes Innocent III and Honorius III a few decades earlier, but reaching its full-fledged canonical form precisely with the investigation around the sanctity of Elizabeth (1232–1235), and her subsequent canonization.² In opposition to the majority of previous legends and miracle accounts, frequently adorned with hagiographic stereotypes and colorful stories, the new type of documentation intends to present a truthful image of the saint-candidate and it authenticates every single assertion with the testimonies

of eyewitnesses. The description of Elizabeth's saintly life is provided by the *Libellus de dictis quatuor ancillarum*, which compiles into a single narrative the testimonies of her handmaids (Huyskens 1911; Würth 2005–2006). The accounts of her 129 miracles (*Miracula felicitatis Elizabethae*), instead of offering the usual elaborate fantastic fables of divine justice mediated by saintly relics, provide a series of brief and dry accounts carrying the imprint of a judicial procedure.³

One cannot fail to recognize the large number of agents in generating and recording these seemingly very authentic popular narratives: Elizabeth's confessor Conrad of Marburg, principal promoter of her canonization and one of the papal legates in the first investigating group; the friars and priests who advised the people to make a pilgrimage to the grave of St. Elizabeth for healing; and the scribes putting the vernacular accounts into written Latin. Yet, in a comparative perspective, one still has to admit: these legends and miracle accounts have the "smell of life," where the social identities and the psychological inclinations seem to transpire with a fairly reliable exactitude. This is what I would call "popular narrative" here, for the sake of convenience.

This could provide useful starting points for a new kind of historical analysis of visions and apparitions: the massive occurrence of accounts of such supernatural events in canonization processes has hitherto been largely unexplored. Let me select three examples of visions related to Elizabeth. The first is from the *Libellus*, a story told by Isentrudis, one of her noble handmaids, a most fascinating image of the communication of Elizabeth with her "heavenly bridegroom," striking with its unadorned, Franciscan style simplicity:

... she fixed her eyes on the open windows and finally started to laugh with a great joy. After a long hour, her eyes closed, she cried infinite tears and soon after she opened her eyes again laughing joyously as before, staying in these contemplations until the compline, sometimes crying with her eyes closed and soon after sometimes laughing with her eyes opened, but with more joy. Finally when she was silent for a time, she suddenly broke out with these words: "My Lord, you want to be with me and I want to be with you and I never want to be separated from you." Having said this, Isentrudis, noblewoman, and her other handmaids and *familiares* immediately asked her to reveal whom she

spoke to. The blessed Elizabeth was difficult to persuade, finally won by their prayers she responded: "I saw the open sky and my lord sweet Jesus bending towards me and consoling me in various difficulties and tribulations which surround me, and when I saw him, I was happy and I laughed, but when he turned his face away I cried. Then pitying me, he again turned his serene face towards me, saying: 'If you want to be with me, I want to be with you.' To which I responded as it was said above." ... She had frequent revelations, visions and divine consolations during her daily and nocturnal prayers. But in all ways suppressing and dissimulating as much as she could she concealed it ... as the Apostle says: keep me from being unduly elated by the magnificence of such revelations (2 Cor. 12.7).⁴

This is the only vision, the only description of an immediate communication with the supernatural in the *Libellus*, and this fact adds a strong emphasis to the exceptional importance of this event, embedded in an overall realistic image of Elizabeth's sainthood acquired by the fervently realized religious ideals of charity, humility, and piety. The strength of the text resides in its accurate description of the physiology of rapture and the fluctuating emotional states of mind characteristic for ecstasies and mystics (Elliott 1997). The desire for mystical union with Christ, appearing in the "open sky" is expressed with the powerful and simple words of mutual marital consent: "If you want to be with me, I want to be with you, and I never want to be separated from you." There could have hardly been a clearer statement of the central longing of late medieval female saints aspiring to live like brides of Christ.

The "bridal" motif of late medieval and early modern feminine spirituality had been expressed in a number of devotional writings, legends, *Schwesterbücher*, and canonization process testimonies from the twelfth to the seventeenth centuries, and it was accompanied by an impressive series of similar visions, from Mary of Oignies, Hadewijch of Brabant, Hedwig of Silesia, Margaret of Cortona, Angela of Foligno, Gertude of Helfta, to Bridget of Sweden, Catherine of Siena and the great early modern mystics such as Theresa of Avila. There has been much historical analysis of this kind of spirituality recently (Bynum 1984, 1987; Kleinberg 1994; Lewis 1996; Klaniczay 2003; Caciola 2003; Elliott 2004). A systematic study of the visions themselves, the "encounters" with Christ

and the Virgin Mary, narrated in these writings, is still to be done (cf. Dinzelbacher 1981; Petroff 1986; Leonardi and Pozzi 1988; Hamburger 1998; Newman 2005).

There is another kind of vision, which is more frequently present in the lists of healing miracles produced during the canonization investigations—the healing occurring in dreams. Let me quote, still from the canonization process of St. Elizabeth, the healing story of Beatrix, a nine-year-old girl, who had a hump and goiter (*gibbosa et strumosa*) and was carried by the stepfather on his back to the sepulcher. They stayed there, together with the mother, for ten days praying for the healing.

Their request had not been heard, and the upset mother started to grumble against Elizabeth, saying: “I will warn everyone not to visit your tomb since you did not listen to me!” And thus she departed in anger. After they traveled a mile and a half, they stopped at a spring near a place called Rosseberch, the daughter crying from the pain in her body. And there, while she was sobbing, she started to sweat and then fell asleep. When she woke up she said she saw in her dream a lady approaching; her face was splendid, her hands graceful and candid and with her hands she touched her body in the back and in the chest and said: “Stand up and walk!” The girl rose up, sweating all over, and shaking in her body she hit her chest with her hand and said to her mother: “O, mother, here I am free in all my body.” And standing upright, she started to walk freed from her hump and goiter and became healthy.⁵

This vision is actually a medieval representative of a very archaic type of healing miracle, the incubatory dream, first appearing in the cult of Asclepius, the “divine doctor” (Hamilton 1906; Edelstein and Edelstein 1945) and, subsequently, in Christian form, in the cults of a number of Byzantine saints, such as Sts. Cosmas and Damian, Sts. John and Cyrus, and St. Artemios (Deubner 1900; Delehaye 1925; Crisafulli and Nesbitt 1997; Csepregi 2007). With some variations, the formula of dream-healing also made its way to Latin hagiography and showed up in the early medieval miracle accounts of Gregory of Tours (Bozóky 2003). Pierre-André Sigal analyzed a total of 2050 posthumous healing miracles, collected from 76 saints’ lives and 166 miracle lists, before the end of the twelfth century.

Within this material he found 259 miracles obtained by dream-healing, which, though a rather small fraction within the entire pool of the recorded miracle accounts, is still a considerable number (Sigal 1985, pp. 139–140).

In the miracle lists of Saint Elizabeth, from the altogether 129 miracles there are six cases where dream-healing plays some kind of a role. Four of these are rather similar to the already presented one: a charmingly simple story of the appearance of a “most beautiful lady” (*pulcherrima domina*) in the dream of the afflicted person, touching the ill person or giving advice on how to obtain healing.⁶ There is, however, one considerably longer miracle story, which provides an illustration of how such rudimentary judicial accounts can develop into a complex fable.

The story is about an “epileptic” Cistercian monk, Henricus, from the monastery Amelungesburnen in Saxony (1/II).

He suffered so gravely and miserably that each night and every other day he lay on the floor or on his bed; his head, back and legs were shaking, he was uttering cries demonstrating a great pain in the body, always keeping four monks at his side to help... one night, as he claims, there appeared to him a woman in white robes who asked whether he would like to be cured, to which he responded: “This is my greatest longing.” She said: “If you want to be cured, make an oath to lady Elizabeth of Marburg and hence you will be cured.”

At first Henricus was reticent or rather afraid to take this oath, but after two renewed apparitions he did, and indeed got better. However,

because the rule of St. Benedict prohibits the monks to take oaths or do other special things without the permission of their spiritual father... the prior said it was possible that the monk was seduced to do this prohibited thing by the apparition and persuasion of a malignant spirit.

But the following night, the same person he saw earlier appeared again and this finally convinced the abbot to allow him to go on pilgrimage and get healed.⁷

This very long and convoluted miracle account is interesting from several points of view. The dream-healing is developed here to a complex set

of serial apparitions, when there is an uncertainty whether the “woman in white robes” was St. Elizabeth herself or just a divine envoy (it frequently happened in early medieval incubation miracles that the saint came in a kind of *incognito* to the patient). The uncertainty goes even further; the superiors in the monastery put the question: wasn’t this apparition rather one by a malignant spirit? With this question we join here the large medieval tradition of the discernment of the spirits (*discretio spirituum*). “Satan himself goes disguised as an angel of light,” as Saint Paul already warned (2 Cor, 11,14). This type of questioning of the origin of the miraculous dreams and apparitions and trying to decide whether the miracles were really obtained by the mediation of the saint or by some kind of magic became one of the key issues to be settled by the new style canonization processes (Switek 1972).

At the same time, the acts of the canonization process of St. Elizabeth also testify of another process: that of narrative and mythological construction. The originally simple patterns of visions and dreams included in the healing miracle narratives get elaborated, restructured, enriched, critically examined, and discerned by the clerics involved in the authentication and the transmission of these stories.

Similar things happened to the vision accounts included in the saints’ legends. One can observe it within the hagiographic tradition of St. Elizabeth herself. Her powerful and simple bridal vision of Christ made its way into her subsequent legends, it was at a central place in the most popular legend collection of the thirteenth century, the *Legenda Aurea* compiled by James of Voragine, who dedicated a special chapter to Elizabeth (Vauchez 1986; Varazze 1998, vol. 2, p. 1168). Still, around the turn of the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries, this apparently did not satisfy all those who venerated Elizabeth as the most popular “modern saint” among women. Since visionary sainthood became the dominating model in late thirteenth-century Europe and, especially in Italy, the original, charity-centered “Franciscan simplicity” of Elizabeth had to be refashioned, adorned by a number of more spectacular vision descriptions as well. In the ample set of re-elaborations of Saint Elizabeth’s hagiography, a number of other hitherto unedited stories appear, describing alleged visionary type events.

A late thirteenth-century “Tuscan vita,” probably originating from Franciscan surroundings, narrates the “miracle of the mantle” and the

“miracle of the rose,” which became two very popular elements of Elizabeth’s late medieval image. The former story describes the embarrassment of Elizabeth when called by her husband to receive a noble guest, but being dressed according to her usual humble ways in very poor and ragged apparel, she could only be rescued by supernatural help: an angel brought her from the heavens “a shining crown and mantle,” saying “adorn yourself with these, that your celestial spouse has sent you from heaven.” Though the latter story, the famous rose miracle—the food taken to the poor by Elizabeth wondrously transformed into roses in wintertime (Lemmens 1902, pp. 15–16; Gecser 2005)—is not a vision account, these two stories illustrate very well how brief reports of a Christo-centric visionary experience get transformed into fascinating hagiographic fables. Another creative literary-hagiographic invention appearing in fourteenth-century Elizabeth hagiography, notably in the amplified versions of the most popular Elizabeth legend written by the Thuringian Dominican friar, Theoderic of Apolda around 1292, is the so-called “*leprosus* legend,” where Elizabeth is described to have given medical care to a suffering leper subsequently put to rest in the bed of her husband, whom the alerted (and probably raging) Count Ludwig sees, with his “inward eyes,” transformed into the “Crucified One,” understanding thus the deeper meaning of charity (Renner 1998, pp. 40–41; Klaniczay 2002, pp. 371–72).⁸ To complete the visionary transformation of Elizabeth’s hagiographic portrait, in early fourteenth-century Tuscany even a separate visionary opusculum got (falsely) attributed to her: the *Revelationes beate Marie virginis facte beate Elisabet filie regis Ungarie* (Oliger 1926–27; Falvay 2005).

It is these truly elaborate literary accounts that I would include in the group of “learned” vision descriptions, building upon a preexistent (or sometimes maybe not even preexistent) immediate, “popular narrative” of visionary experience, turning it into theologically meaningful discourse, and, frequently, also transforming experiences stemming from a specific feminine spirituality into the male narrative of the confessors and the spiritual directors. This is what Friar Arnaldo was probably doing with the visions of Angela da Foligno or Raymond of Capua with those of St. Catherine of Siena (Bynum 1987; Mooney 1999; Coakley 2006).

*From Fable to Experience,
from Imagination to Reality*

Late medieval religious visions, especially towards the end of the Avignon papacy and even more during the Great Schism (1379–1414), became thus inextricably entangled in learned theological systems and the debates of the highest ecclesiastical sphere. The most spectacular prophetic-visionary oeuvre of John Rupescissa, Saint Bridget of Sweden, Saint Catherine of Siena, and a number of female prophets in the Schism period (Vauchez 1990; Rusconi 1999; Blumenfeld-Kosinski 2006) provoked an increasing irritation among broad circles of the ecclesiastical elite—the influence of this new source of revelation had to be curtailed.

This led to a new vogue of the genre of the “discernment of spirits” in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries, with important treatises by leading theological authorities such as Heinrich von Friemar, Heinrich von Langenstein, Pierre d’Ailly, and several ones by Jean Gerson, trying to distinguish between “true and false apparitions” (cf. Switek 1972; Hohmann 1977; Voaden 1999; Elliott 2002; Klaniczay 2003, pp. 40–62; Caciola 2003, pp. 284–314). The most influential work in this tradition was the book entitled *Formicarius* (Anthill) written around 1436 by Johannes Nider (1380–1438), a leading figure of the Dominican observance and a spokesman of the Council of Basel (Nider 2005; Tschacher 2000; Bailey 2002; Klaniczay 2003).⁹ His book not only resumed the entire critical repertoire elaborated in the previous debates in connection with late medieval visions and apparitions, but related these doubts to the emerging new collective anxiety of the age, the menace of diabolic witchcraft.

This association was certainly influenced by the fact that Nider’s work was written in the precise historical moment when the amazing success and then the scandalous trial of Joan of Arc brought about a decisive turn in the appreciation of visions and apparitions (Christian 1981, pp. 188–94; Fraioli 1999; Sullivan 1999; Elliott 2004, pp. 315–68). The *Pucelle’s* extraordinary deeds gave new actuality to the question that had been lingering in the mind of those who wanted to “discern the spirits” in the amazing visions of late medieval ecstasies: were those voices or apparitions coming from God and its angels or were they rather from the Devil and its

allies? Nider personally witnessed the echoes of the case of Joan of Arc at the Council of Basel. On the basis of this, he gave a detailed account on Joan “deifying herself and appearing in male attire.” Joan

would have stated of herself that she has God’s angel as her familiar, but according to a large number of interpretations and examinations of most learned men, this was judged to have been rather a malevolent spirit, and consequently secular justice had been instructed that the spirit and the witch (maga) under its influence should be burned.¹⁰

Joan’s condemnation and the ensuing debates testify to the fact that the borderlines between heavenly and diabolic apparitions, in this period of generalized doubt and skepticism, were becoming more and more uncertain, to the point of vanishing almost completely.

This constellation makes Nider’s *Formicarius* a fitting example for illustrating another, related change in the history of heavenly and/or diabolic visions and apparitions: the advent of a new age of credulity, the conversion of fable and fantasy to reality. In current anthropological debates, Michael Taussig (1998) has usefully underlined that faith and skepticism, unconditional acceptance of “other types” of realities and rational doubts, while opposed to each other, are also presupposing each other and usually coexist in pairs, not only in the same ages or the same milieus, but also in the worldview of individual thinkers. The fluctuating evaluation of late medieval visions and Nider’s work in particular is a good illustration for this.

Nider is truly skeptical of “false, simulated visions.” Though he seldom mentions the ultimate argument, their allegedly “satanic” origin, and still turns with veneration to “truthful” visions of real, living saints, he dedicates the entire Book III of his treatise to an enumeration of a number of cases where the claim of the contact with the supernatural is nothing but fraud, deception, and humbuggery. He describes, for instance, a certain “*fraticellus*” or “*semi-beghardus*” living in the town of Bern who acquired a considerable notoriety by throwing about stones and pieces of wood in his house at night, making the kind of racket that haunting ghosts would make. He shut himself up in his room,

changed his voice and started moaning and groaning, pretending that he was the spirit of a deceased local notable. Then he started answering the questions of the curious, as if the spirits themselves were answering.¹¹

He even collected money to be able to undertake pilgrimages to earn indulgences for the deceased. After a while, however, his activities grew suspicious; his clients started suspecting him, exposed the hoax, and he got what he deserved (Caciola 2000, pp. 69–73; Klaniczay 2003, pp. 8–9).

From among such fraudulent apparitions, the most disturbing ones were related to holy women of “high repute.” These women, according to Nider, would

lose all sense of the external world, and, by force of their interior devotion, fall into a profound ecstasy. I myself have witnessed an occasion when a woman, listening to a sermon on the love of Christ, let out loud shrieks and moans before the eyes of all the congregation, as if unable to control her overwhelming love for Christ. Most educated people consider demonstrations of this sort to be mere simulation.¹²

Nider gives a number of examples to validate his skeptical view of female visionaries. He knew a Dominican nun who lived a life beyond reproach before she entered the order, and immediately thereafter. When, however, she heard in this reformed convent of the extraordinary lives lived by the saints of old, she was overcome with the desire to be considered one of them.

She feigned ecstasy and pretended to have received revelations, though she had had neither experience, as she admitted later in the presence of her superior ... In acts of pure simulation, she began to cry out joyfully for all to hear, and then fell to the floor, pretending to be beside herself in ecstasy.¹³

A similar story had been narrated to Nider by a fellow Dominican preaching in the Rhineland, about a woman renowned for her holiness. During the sermon, “she uttered cries of rejoicing before all the multitude;

but she did this, as she later confessed, not from a surfeit of love, but from a vain desire for attention.”¹⁴

To convince their rather skeptical clerical and lay “public,” these visionaries had to resort to visible bodily proofs of their contact with the supernatural going far beyond the outward signs of ecstasy which, as we have seen, could be put down as simulation. The most prestigious of these signs was the reception of the holy wounds of Christ, the *stigmata*. After the “founding miracle” of Saint Francis of Assisi (Vauchez 1968; Schmucki 1991; Frugoni 1993; Davidson 1998), this claim has been voiced by or attributed to several female visionaries throughout the Middle Ages. In the thirteenth century it was claimed by beguines such as Elizabeth of Spalbeek (Simons and Ziegler 1990; Simons 1994; Caciola 2002, pp. 113–25) or Christina of Stommeln (Kleinberg 1992, pp. 40–98), Cistercian nuns such as Lukardis of Oberweimar (Kleinberg 1992, pp. 101–11) or the heterodox, but also Cistercian-supported cult of Guglielma of Milan (Benedetti 1998, p. 86; Newman 2005). In the fourteenth century it was attributed to Dominican nuns such as Saint Margaret of Hungary, the Blessed Helen of Hungary (Klaniczay 2002), then, most prominently, to Catherine of Siena (Giunta 1999), a series to be continued subsequently in the late fifteenth century by Lucia Broccadelli (da Narni), Caterina Racconigi, Stefana Quinzani di Soncino, and Osanna Andreasi (cf. Zarri 1990, pp. 87–164; Herzig 2006).

Nider also provides a report of a claim of stigmatization just before the Council of Constance, in the small nearby town of Radolfzell. A saintly recluse living in the town “often lay prostrate in a state of ecstasy, and when she came to, described the secret revelations that she had received. ... One day the news started to be spread that the five wounds of Christ would appear on her hands, feet and side on a particular day.”¹⁵ A great throng of the curious gathered for the occasion; they found the recluse lying on the floor of her cell, “motionless in her rapture, and quite beside herself” (*velut in raptu, immobilis, fatua*), but the *stigmata* failed to appear, to the great consternation of all those who had believed in the woman’s enigmatic teachings and revelations (*deliramentis et ejus revelationibus*). Among those present was Heinrich von Rheinfelden (d. 1433), a Dominican friar and “professor of theology,” who took advantage of the occasion to preach a fire and brimstone sermon about the dangers of believing in “foolishness” of this sort. Not much later, the

fraudulent woman (*ipsa fictrix*) and an associate of hers were obliged to appear before an ecclesiastical court; here she retracted her claims, and repented of her sins.

A comparable desperate attempt to challenge the doubts concerning the truthfulness of visionary experience, a similar claim to perform the miraculous bodily transformation in public was repeated, in another form, by a Clariss nun, Magdalena Beutlerin, who was renown for her spectacular raptures and revelations in Fribourg, in the 1430s (Petroff 1986, pp. 350–55; Dinzelbacher 1995, pp. 91–93; Klaniczay 2003, pp. 12–14). She declared before Christmas 1430 that she would die during the following Epiphany. She said that her devoted followers could assist at this spectacle and thereby escape the tortures of hell. The news attracted a great deal of attention, and various secular and ecclesiastic notables, urban authorities, and also a certain Magister Paulus, a professional doctor and a large crowd appeared in her convent for the announced date to witness the event. The detailed description, acquired by Nider from a Dominican friar who was present, narrates that Magdalena fell into ecstasy in the convent church and lay motionless for a while. As the bystanders were curious whether she was dead or alive, the doctor publicly touched her pulse and confirmed that she was still alive. Then, in a strange coarse voice, she asked to be put into the sarcophagus prepared there for her. This was carried out, but she still remained alive. The impatient crowd was quickly losing faith. Finally she arose from the sarcophagus in front of the crowd and asked for food. She hoped to save face by referring to a new revelation communicating her that divine intentions had changed and she would be left alive.

This series of stories in the *Formicarius*, reporting of quasi-experimental testing of the truthfulness of supernatural claims, also included an anecdote related to the archetypal myth concerning the ecstatic capacity of the witches: their ability to fly. The belief concerning women who go out for a nightly ride in the air with goddess Diana is continuously attested from the early Middle Ages on. Penitential handbooks of the medieval church have been condemning this belief as vain superstition since the instructions of Regino of Prüm dating from 906. The condemnation has been taken up in the *Decretum* of Burchard of Worms as stemming from the Synod of Ancyra of 314, and was incorporated in the twelfth century into the *Decretum* of Gratian with the

name *Canon episcopi* (Ginzburg 1991, pp. 89–91; Tschacher 1999). According to the text

some wicked women, perverted by the Devil, seduced by illusions and phantasms of demons, believe and profess themselves, in the hours of the night, to ride upon certain beasts with Diana, the goddess of pagans, and an innumerable multitude of women, and in the silence of the dead of night to traverse great spaces of earth, and to obey her commands as of their mistress, and to be summoned to her service on certain nights... Wherefore the priests throughout their churches should preach with all insistence to the people that they may know this to be in every way false and that such phantasms are imposed on the minds of the faithful not by the divine but by the malignant spirit. (Kors and Peters 2001, p. 62)

Despite the (rather “enlightened”) medieval interdictions, these mythological constructs survived in various forms in legends, literary creations, and in folklore (*Herodiada*, *Dame Habonde*, *Satia*), and as Carlo Ginzburg has shown (1991, pp. 89–108), they contributed to the emerging mythology of the witches’ Sabbath. The early fifteenth century, when the *Formicarius* was conceived, is precisely the moment of this gradual reversal of the condemning ecclesiastical attitude to an unconditional acceptance of the possibility of such nightly flights, which was the consequence of, and a further stimulus to, the emerging witch persecutions.

Nider is in this matter still on the critical and skeptical side: his anecdote presents the well-known story as something that happened to his own preceptor, and only fleetingly refers to his related readings in the field of canon law. He describes how a “*vetula dementata*” claimed to be carried through the air on a night ride with Diana. Like the contested stigmatic just mentioned, she seemed to be willing to perform her ecstatic journey while being observed, and accepted the request of the Dominican friar to be present at this occasion. She sat in a large bowl used for kneading dough, positioned on a bench. She rubbed herself with her ointment, uttered magic incantations; whereupon her head leaned back, and she fell asleep almost immediately. She apparently had some “demonic dreams” in the company of “*Domina Venere*.” She exploded into joyful jubilation, fluttered her hands and her whole body shook with violent gestures. Then

she fell off the bench together with her bowl, badly hitting her head, and then lay in deep sleep for some hours. When she awoke, she was told that she had not been on a ride with Diana. She became very confused when all the witnesses confirmed that her body was seen to remain motionless in the room the entire time.¹⁶

Nider uses this example in the row of the previously mentioned ones, supporting his skeptical view on the veracity of visions and other supernatural manifestations of the late medieval charismatic female visionaries, and paves the way by this anecdote to bring them into the dangerous neighborhood of a new type of diabolic apparition: the horrendous “novelty” of the witches’ Sabbath. This emerging demonological narrative has been described for the first time in a set of documents emerging from the witchcraft persecutions in early fifteenth-century Switzerland and Savoy, the treatises by the secular judge Claude Tholosan (*Ut magorum et maleficiorum errores manifesti ignorantibus fiant* – 1436), the anonymous *Errorres gazariorum* (around 1437), the Lucerne chronicle by Johann Fründ on the witch hunts in the Wallis between 1428 and 1430, the *Le champion des dames* written by the papal secretary, Martin le Franc (1440–42), and, not the least, some of the most eloquent testimonies preserved in Book V of *Formicarius* (*L’imaginaire du sabbat*; Nider 2005). The general discussion on the emerging concept of the diabolic witches’ Sabbath has been reformulated on the basis of these newly edited or reedited documents, and a series of studies carried out by the research group around Agostino Paravicini Bagliani in Lausanne—the study of Martine Ostorero gives a good account of all this (cf. also Bailey 2002; Klaniczay 2003). In my present study, I should like to make two observations within this context.

The first is the curious fact that Nider’s generally skeptical approach to visions was surprisingly reversed when talking about diabolic apparitions allegedly experienced by witches. He reports without his habitual critical alertness the accounts he heard from a witch-persecuting judge from Bern, called Peter, on the secret gatherings of the witches. In a church on Sunday morning, before the blessing with the holy water, they denied Christ, their Christian faith, and the Catholic Church, and swore to follow the Devil, whom they called *magisterulus*.¹⁷ Nider gives the appearance that he considers these accounts rather a reality than an illusion or an apparition. Furthermore, he explicitly discusses the issue whether nightly

demons can physically injure humans. Judge Peter told him the story of his own personal encounter with witchcraft. After he had already given up his office as judge, the witches avenged themselves on him by pushing him off a flight of steps in the dead of night. He was found the next morning, bruised and bloody. Nider adds an explanation:

We needn't believe that Peter was physically pushed off the steps by some witches who were not there; it was very much the present demons conjured up by the witches' rites and sacrifices that led to Peter's fall... It is by the impact of the witches on the imagination that the demons can evoke the sensation of being absent or present.¹⁸

There is no sense of the same critical alertness here with which Nider put rational questions to the experiential performance and the veracity of late medieval female charismatics. At the same time, we can see that the fable of the witches' Sabbath is gaining an increasing credibility among the ecclesiastical elite of the age, who receive with eager attention the confirmation of this myth from the confessions of the accused witches. My second observation relates to Claude Tholosan, a contemporary of Nider, a secular judge who conducted more than a hundred witch trials in the region of Briançon, in Dauphiné (Hansen 1901, pp. 539–44; Marx 1914, pp. 32–43; Paravy 1993, pp. 783 ff.), and also wrote the abovementioned treatise on the “errors of the magicians and the witches,” partly describing the beliefs and practices of the new sect of the witches and partly advising judges how to proceed against this crime.

In his description of the witches' Sabbath, included in the treatise, Tholosan, like Nider, performs a balancing act between the skepticism of the *Canon episcopi* and the folkloristic wealth of confessions that he himself had had a hand in extracting under torture. On the one hand, he emphasizes that the witches' self-perception that they have physically (*corporaliter*) gone off to an assembly (*synagoga*) is an “illusion” suggested by the Devil in their sleep; on the other hand, he assembles the information available to him on the matter in a systematic description of what could be considered to be a real ritual for venerating the Devil. He describes how on Thursdays and Saturdays the witches fly to their conclave on magic wands greased with the magic ointment; at times they ride on a broom or on the backs of wild animals. Once at the witches'

Sabbath, they kneel to the Devil, kiss him on the lips, and have intercourse with him. His body is as cold as ice (*frigidum sicut glacies*). They have intercourse with demons and with one another, sometimes in an “unnatural way” (*contra naturam*). Then they kill children—at times their own—who have been brought there to be cooked and eaten, or make maleficent powders and ointments out of them. The devils then open all kinds of dwellings to them, where they can eat and drink, make music, and dance in a circle (Paravy 1979, pp. 356–57; *L’imaginaire du sabbat*, pp. 364–66; Kors and Peters 2001, pp. 333–39). The court records of confessions made in Tholosan’s presence enrich this description with colorful folkloric detail. Witches, we learn, use black or chestnut horses and rabbits to get around. When they dance in circles, the head devil keeps time on a drum; their merrymaking comes to an end when the cock crows (Marx 1914, pp. 36–39).

Claude Tholosan also extracted confessions from the accused on how they made their alliance with the Devil on the Sabbath:

“They stand in a circle and put a pot in the middle. The Devil urinates in it; they drink it, and then bend backwards for the purpose of totally abjuring their faith in Christ.” The novice then “draws a cross on the ground for the purpose of dishonoring Jesus Christ ... he stomps on it three times with his left foot, spits on it thrice, urinates on it, and then defecates on it; he then turns his bared bottom toward the east, thumbs his nose, and spitting once more, says: ‘I deny you, prophet!’”¹⁹

The Devil—Tholosan tells us in his treatise—appears at these rituals “in the form of a man and/or a number of animals.” From the more verbose documents of the witch trials that Tholosan held in Briançon after 1436, we learn that the Devil is a man dressed in black, whose “eyes burn like coal and are as big as a calf’s; his tongue hangs to the ground, his legs are bowed, his toes are black.” He is a Saracen with red hair, a young white man, a white child, a black cat, a black dog, a black pig or a black cock.²⁰

In the same collection of documents, we find one instance when the various demons were arranged into a sophisticated symbolic system. Jubertus de Bavaria, who was sentenced in 1437, had three devils appear to him regularly: *Luxuriosus*, who appeared in the form of a lovely twelve-year-old virgin, and “slept with him and had her pleasure of him at night”;

Superbus, a middle-aged man dressed in black; and *Avarus*, an old man dressed in tattered clothes but whose purse was full of gold.²¹ (One may well wonder whether we find here a “popular” echo of late medieval moral preaching or a “learned” invention of the cultured judge.)

On the whole, if one compares the demonological treatises with the multiplying documents of witchcraft persecution, the following tendency becomes apparent. Unlike what we have observed at the medieval canonization processes, legends, and miracles, where a simple and experience-based form gets elaborated into a complex visionary narrative, my impression is that in late medieval witch trials rather the opposite procedure occurs. A learned mythological construct of the secret, nightly cult of the Devil is forced upon the reality of witchcraft accusations.

This suggestion is certainly not a new one in witchcraft research. The mainstream of nineteenth and twentieth-century historiography, from Wilhelm Gottlieb Soldan (1843), Joseph Hansen (1900), and Henry Charles Lea (1939) to Norman Cohn (1975) and Richard Kieckhefer (1976) departed from the assumption that the vision of the diabolic witches’ Sabbath was a learned construct injected into the popular *imaginaire* by ecclesiastical and judicial propaganda and constraining mechanisms, and subsequently confirmed by confessions obtained from the accused witches using suggestive questions and torture. The question to be examined more closely, along this line of arguments, would consist above all in the specific nature of the psychological and physical/bodily constraints, the procedure of interrogation and torture which achieve this specific blending of diabolical concepts coming from the “elite” and the desperate fantasies and improvisations of the accused who are trying to ease their pains by complying with the demands of the interrogators (Rowland 1990; Roper 1992 and 2004, pp. 44–65).

This approach, however, had been challenged by other researchers, who were convinced that the nocturnal visions of the witches’ Sabbath took their core elements instead from “popular” mythologies and religious practices. After a romantic vision of “pagan,” and “feminine” anti-Christian resistance by Jules Michelet (1862) or the erroneous anthropological concept of a secret diabolic cult by Margaret Murray (1921), archaic, “shamanistic” practices and concepts were detected by Carlo Ginzburg (1966 and 1991), and I contributed to this as well (Klaniczay 1984 and 2003), whereas Éva Pócs (1989 and 1998) pointed to

the possible impact of fairy and *mora* beliefs, and that of other popular mythological constructs. There were also interpretations which saw in the nightmarish vision of the Sabbath a “world turned upside down,” a simple symbolic inversion of the rituals that could be observed in ecclesiastical or popular festivities (Clark 1980; Muchembled 1988).

In my present study, in guise of a conclusion, I should like to direct the attention of witchcraft research to yet another possibility of interpretation: namely to the consideration of a considerable group of accounts on the witches’ Sabbath as a specific type of popular vision narratives.

The Sabbath Narratives of the Accusers

My examples come from the documents of 2275 Hungarian witch trials against 4212 accused witches (3673 women and 590 men) between the sixteenth and the eighteenth centuries.²² In this documentation, there are more than a hundred Sabbath descriptions stemming from witchcraft confessions, mainly extorted under torture—the most noteworthy ones come from the biggest “witch panic”²³ in Hungary, the Szeged persecutions of 1728 (cf. Reizner 1900). But there is also another significant group, whose number almost equals the witches’ delirious confessions: the Sabbath descriptions given by the accusers who complained of having been attacked by the witches during the night and carried away to the witches’ Sabbath.

As to the cultural or judicial context defining these descriptions, they differ fundamentally from the Sabbath accounts of the accused and tortured witches. Though undeniably influenced by the circulation of nightmarish Sabbath stories generated by the witch panic and supported by the sensational confessions extorted from the accused by torture, the accusers come forward with autonomous narrative constructs, and claim to have really experienced these diabolic visions. In these Sabbath accounts, there are no traces of any constraint or forceful suggestion coming from “learned” interrogators. I have already tried to make a plea for a special consideration of this extraordinary type of source material (Klaniczay 1993), and I will draw on that corpus of sources here again.

The first such nightmarish vision accounts come from the witch trials of Kolozsvár (Cluj, Romania) from the second half of the sixteenth

century, where some of the witches are said to have aggressed the victim in the shape of a dog subsequently changing into a wild boar, from the mouth of which flames came forth (Komáromy 1910, p. 5). Other testimonies describe archetypal stories on “the terror coming in the night” (cf. Hufford 1982). The witches enter the witnesses’ room through the window, in groups of three, four, or seven, menace the paralyzed victims, maltreat them, harm and bewitch the children sleeping in the room near the mother and “extract” their bones (Komáromy 1910, pp. 64, 78–79). Similar nightly aggression accounts are narrated by the witch-accusers in the region of Pozsony (Bratislava, Slovakia), where the diabolic Sabbath concepts have frequently appeared in the witchcraft confessions of the beginning of the seventeenth century (Horna 1933). In 1618 and 1627, witnesses in the trials in Sempste, describe the witches coming into their sleeping rooms through the window, dancing and feasting there, pulling them out of their beds, dragging them naked thrice around their house, menacing and maltreating them (Schram 1982, vol. 3, pp. 233–39; Klaniczay, Kristóf, and Pócs 1989, pp. 390–91, 405–6).

The accounts on the nightly appearance of the witches is the kernel from which the more colorful Sabbath descriptions develop, where the witches have a feast in the house or the courtyard of the victims, feast and dance there, consume their food and drink, or carry them away to some other places, to the wine cellars, to the main square or the border of the village or to some near or remote mountain.²⁴ At times, witches are said to transform the victim into a horse—as we hear, for instance, in 1739 in the borough Hódmezővásárhely, from the account of a servant accusing the wife of his master,

the witch came to him in green female dress during the night, she pulled him up from his lying position by his hair, pushed a bridle into his mouth and changed him instantly to a yellow-haired horse with a saddle on the back, and so she rode on the back of the witness to Mount Saint Gellért where an innumerable army was gathered also from other places, and they diverted themselves with many kinds of music and exquisite food... (Schram 1970, vol. 1, p. 253).

The nightly appearance of the witches frequently takes the form of sexual aggression: witches sometimes take up the shape of the wife or the

husband of the victim and thus rape and maltreat them (1612 – Komáromy 1910, p. 77), other victims complain of having been raped by the witch coming upon them in the form of a horse or a bull (Schram 1982, vol. 3, p. 204). In some cases, these descriptions are colored by weird sexual phantasies—witches bite and damage the genital organs of the victims (Schram 1970, vol. 1, p. 155; vol. 2, p. 335).

Ultimately, we find a similar folkloric variety of realistic details, stereotypical stories and improvised inventions as in the Sabbath accounts in the torture confessions of the accused witches. With one very noteworthy difference though: while in the torture confessions the Devil is at a central place both in the witches' gathering and he is also the protagonist in the depraved orgies of the witches, he is almost altogether absent from the Sabbath accounts of the accusers, where the figures performing all the evil deeds are just the witches themselves. In the few cases where devil-like characters also appear, they remain in the background as distant, secondary actors.

Let me conclude with one of the most detailed Sabbath accounts from a witch-accuser in Hungarian documentation which provides an example of this. It comes from a witch trial against a certain "black skirted woman" living as a poor beggar in Western Hungary, at the borough Csorna, who was tried for charges of witchcraft together with her daughters, Eörse (Elizabeth) and Kata (Catherine) Szekér, in 1733, in the years which witnessed the (rather belated) peak of Hungarian witch hunts.

The Sabbath description is provided by the alleged victim of the witches' aggression, a maidservant in the household of Matthias Bognár, a farmer living on the estate of Prince Eszterházy, the "honest girl" (*honesta puella*) Éva Katona, 16 years of age, who confessed the following:

During Lent, she asked her patroness for permission to leave to take part at a mourning festivity after a funeral... She stayed there and entertained herself with some other young lads and maidens. She spent enough time there and the hour came when she was supposed to go home. She first felt some kind of a great fear coming upon her. She started praying; but even her prayer-book fell out of her hands. Then suddenly the abovementioned Eörse Szekér entered the room and turned to her. She reprehended her why she had not gone home yet to her patron who was going to leave the morrow and who was upset at

her for not having fed the cows. But the witness remained in the room. She reproved her for the second time, and the witness still did not go home. Only when Eörse Szekér scorned the witness for the third time, making reference to her mistress, did she leave the mourning house, but when she reached the courtyard she suddenly lost her sight. Soon there appeared Kata Szekér, she took her by the hand and led her to a plantation garden, where [a company of witches] came forth by the sound of drums and trumpets and they tried to force the witness to join their company. Since she refused this, they started beating and torturing her. After many painful torments they carried her to the stream called Keszegér where they took a bath. And while these fair women were bathing in the stream, they made the witness hold their clothes, she remarked in the interrogation that she would have rather carried any other heavy burden than those women's clothes. Among the bathing women she did not recognize anyone except the two daughters Eörse and Kata of the abovementioned black skirted woman. After the bathing there came huge whirlwind and it took them to the top of a high mountain and there again they tried to force the witness to join them, or else, they said, they would throw her down from the ridge to the precipice [which they indeed did]. After all these tribulations, the witness could not stand up, and they did not come down to her for a while. Then, like a hen to be roasted, she was tied by the hands and carried down to the village of Csorna to the small street, with a flag and the sound of a drum and a trumpet. They stopped in front of the house of Joseph Mattyus, the tax official. They tied the witness to the door near the wine-barrels and started to feast. During those amusements in the street, the evil ones dragged a cow and a black dog with themselves. Meanwhile, they tried to force the witness again to join their company. After the feast when they came down with their flag from the hill where they had danced, they freed her from beside the barrels and took her to the house of her master and pushed her through the porch door and even there they continued to frighten her in various ways. But before they pushed her through the porch door, they tied her to a tree in the courtyard and there came to her a tall man with a book in his hand asking her to write her name into it and tried to trick the witness saying: Do not believe in the black scripture [i.e. the Bible], for hell is also totally black but do believe in the red and yel-

low scripture [i.e. the inscriptions made with blood] because Paradise is also red and yellow; and those who do not believe in the book he has in his hands, shall never see Paradise—this is how he tried to deceive her. After all this, about two weeks later, one afternoon they ravished her again and took her to the brick oven of the provost and threw her twice into the oven, trying to constrain her to join their company and sign the book with her blood. When she got out of the oven, there came from the barn of the provost a huge tall man, wearing a coat (since it was raining), and he approached her, called her by her name holding a big book in his hands. He attempted to force her to cut her finger and sign the book but she did not do it. After this her master and mistress, not knowing where she was, asked their lodger to find her. He then took her home. In the end, she says that she would never be well again and she believes she could not blame anybody else but the black skirted woman and her two daughters Eörse and Kata, who destroyed her and made her miserable (Schram 1970, vol. 2, pp. 92–93).

This exceptionally detailed story provides a good example of the complexity of these narratives. We know from the trial documentation that the interrogation was led by one of the judges of the County of Sopron, Ferenc Hannibál, who was indeed obsessed with diabolic witchcraft and who participated in several similar cases which lead to the condemnation and burning of witches.²⁵ The story narrated by the maid is also told, with some variations, by her mistress, who adds the detail that the witches threatened to impale her with a glowing spit to force her to enter their company (Schram 1970, vol. 2, pp. 96–97), also summarized in the text of the judicial accusation of the trial (Schram 1970, vol. 2, p. 83)—so it is difficult to find the “authentic” variant of the diabolic vision of the maidservant which has probably been shaped and augmented by the various informal and formal occasions when it was told. The story is remarkable for its epic length and repetitive structure: the stereotypical Sabbath motifs (feasting, drinking, dancing, processions, flags, drums, trumpets, and flying on the top of the mountain) recur three times, and make a good narrative exploitation of contrasts: high and low, mountain and valley, bathing in the stream or being thrown into the fiery oven, feasting on the borderline of the village civilization or in the very center, in the cellar of the tax officer or the yard of the provost.

We also encounter a few valuable archaic motifs: we hear of the “beautiful women,” which has been a recurrent denomination of witches since the sixteenth century (*pulchrae mulieres*) and whom Éva Pócs (1989) has identified as belonging to the local “fairy”—antecedents of Sabbath beliefs. The cows or oxen carried in the witches’ procession might also betray some archaic beliefs (Ginzburg 1991, pp. 92–93).

The presence of a “diabolic book,” the requirement from the victim to sign her name in it with her own blood, a well-known stereotype from demonological treatises, and the appearance of a devil-like male figure administering this ceremony is quite exceptional in Sabbath descriptions stemming from “popular” witch-accusers.²⁶ This may provide an indication of the success of the demonological constructs in haunting the accusers’ mind in times of a true witch-panic. On the other hand, it is worthwhile noting the realistic or comic details that our witness feels somehow necessary to add to these demonological elements. The diabolic witch-master was wearing a cloak “since it was raining.” The argument concerning the inverted significance of the black and the red colored letters, wickedly meant to be persuasive, reminds us of the ruses young village lads could have employed in the tavern to confuse and cheat the handmaids considered too silly to see through their plot.

All taken together, such “popular” accounts on the Sabbath by witchcraft accusers have much to reveal. The confrontation with “popular” dream-vision narratives related to saints, the comparison with other types of vision or Sabbath accounts, either coming from or influenced by learned treatises, or being produced in a constraining judicial, interrogatory, or confession situation, or coming from a “professional” popular healer or soothsayer—all these different types should now be distinguished and characterized on different geographic and chronological samples. This would take us closer to understanding the ambivalence and the historical metamorphoses of saintly and diabolic visions.

Notes

- 1 The distinction between “popular” beliefs and learned explanatory systems is a contested one. I use it in the sense given to it by Peter Burke (1978). According to this, “popular culture” is the culture generally shared by various (potentially all) social strata and cultural milieus, and transmitted both in oral, ritual, and in writ-

ten forms; “learned” or “elite” culture is a second system of reference for some strata and milieus within the larger societies, based on more elaborate, principally written, cultural transmission mechanisms, and special institutions.

- 2 For the evolution of the canonization procedures, see Vauchez 1981 and Goodich 1982; for Saint Elizabeth’s canonization process, see Klaniczay 2004.
- 3 Huyskens 1908; Wendel-Widmer 1987; I have discussed the testimonies in this trial recently in Klaniczay 2004.
- 4 *“oculos defixos habebat versus fenestram apertos et tandem cepit dulciter ridere in magna vultus hilaritate. Post magnam autem horam clausis oculis emisit lacrimas infinitas et breviter post aperuit oculos, iterum ridens iocundissime ut prius in ea iacens contemplatione usque ad completorium, quandoque flens causis oculis et breviter quandoque ridens apertis oculis, sed multo plus immorans iocunditati. Tandem cum diu tacuisset, subito prorupit in hec verba: ‘Ita Domine Tu vis esse mecum et ego volo esse Tecum et nunquam volo a Te separari.’ Dicta ergo Ysentrudis nobilis femina plus reliquis pedissequis ei familiaris instanter rogabat eam revelar sibi, cum quo esset locuta. Beata vero Elizabeth difficilem se reddens, tandem precibus eius victa respondit: Vidi celum apertum et illum dulcem Jesum dominum meum inclinantem se ad me et consolantem me de variis angustiis et tribulationibus, que circumdederunt me et cum vidi eum, iocunda fui risi, cum vero vultum avertit, tamquam recessurus, flevi. Qui misertus mei iterum vultum suum serenissimum ad me convertit dicens: ‘Si tu vis esse mecum, ego ero Tecum’. Cui ego respondi sicut supradictum est. Revelationes autem, visiones et consolations divinas frequenter habuit multas in diurnis et nocturnis orationibus constituta. Quod tamen ipsa modis omnibus supprimans et dissimulans, quantum poterat, occultabat asserens in huiusmodi summopere cavendum, ne spiritus superbie subrepat, ut ait apostolus: ‘Ne magnitudo revelationum extollat me.’”* Huyskens 1911, pp. 122–123. (Unless otherwise stated, the translations are my own.)
- 5 *“Tandem mater eius, voto facto pro filia, sepulchrum domine Elyzabet cum ipsa filia et oblationibus visitavit; vitrico puella ipsam in dorso suo portante per decem dies apud sepulchrum cottidie orantes permanebant. Postea consummatis diebus hiis, cum non exaudirentur, mater irata murmuravit contra dominam Elyzabet, dicens, ‘omnes avertam homines a visitatione sepulchri tui, quia non exaudisti me’. Et sic irata recedens, cum peregrisset miliare et dimidium, resedit iuxta fontem apud villam, que dicitur Rosseberch, filia eius ex dolore corporis multum plorante. Et dum ploraret, cepit sudare et obdormiens parum, cum evigilasset, dixit se in sompno quandam dominam ad se venientem vidisse, cuius facies splendida erat, manus graciles et candide, que manibus suis linivit corpus eius in dorso et in pectore et dixit: ‘O mater, ecce iam resolvor in toto corpore meo’. Et sursum erecta, libere cepit ire et liberata a gibbo et struma, totius corporis sanitatem recepit. Unde mater et vitricus et filia, ad sepulchrum redeuntes, Deo et sancte Elyzabet gratias referebant; sportam, in qua quella puella portata fuerat, apud sepulchrum relinquentes.”* Miracle 3/I, Huyskens 1908, pp. 159–160.
- 6 Miracles 40/1, 76/1, 105/1, 23/II, cf. Huyskens 1908.
- 7 *“... Ita graviter ac miserabiliter vexabatur, ut singulis noctibus et insuper alternis diebus pateretur, terram vel lectum capite, dorso ac pedibus pulsans, gemitus dans*

magni doloris testes et sepe quatuor fratrum ad se tenendum adiutorio opus habens... nocte quadam, sicut ipse asseruit, apparuit ei quedam domina in vestibus albis, a qua interrogatus, si curari vellet, respondit: 'Libentissimus'. Et illa: 'Si vis,' inquit, 'curari, vove te domine Elyzabet de Marpurc et sic curaberis.' "ob institutione regule, scilicet Benedicti, qui vetat fratres sine permissione spiritalis patris speciale aliquid facere vel vovere, inordinatum esse dicebant et illicitum votum a monacho sic emissum. Adiecit et prior dicens possibile fore monachos ad huiusmodi prohibita malignorum spirituum apparitione et persuasione seduci." Miracle 1/II, Huyskens 1908, pp. 243–244.

- 8 For the most up-to-date overview of Elizabeth's hagiography, see Chapter I of Ottó Gecser's related Ph.D. dissertation (2007).
- 9 In the following citations from the *Formicarius*, I have used the Helmstedt edition of 1692, which appeared under the changed title *De visionibus ac revelationibus*; the cited page numbers of the Latin quotes refer to this volume.
- 10 *Formicarius* 5, 8, pp. 600–2, "fassa est, se habere familiarem Dei angelum, qui iudicio literatissimorum virorum iudicatus est esse malignus spiritus ex multis conjecturis & probationibus, per quem spiritum velut magam effectam ignibus per publicam iustitiam consumi permiserunt." Quoted in Klaniczay 2003, p. 61.
- 11 *Formicarius* 3.1, p. 288: "mutata voce verbis gemebundis, ac si anima esset alicujus defuncti, in civitate bene noti, responsa sciscitantibus dedit, asserendo se animam esse cujusdam nuper defuncte persone."
- 12 *Formicarius* 3.1, pp. 292–93: "Vidi aliquando & audivi saepius feminas, ut videbantur satis bonae famae, rapi, quantum visu perpensi potuit, ad interiora ab externis sensibus, quasi ecstasin quandam ex devotione paterentur. Vidi insuper aliam, quae in publica praedicatione alicujus de Christi "charitate auditâ sententiâ, coram omnibus clamorem quandam elatum extulit, quasi non valeret amorem sui pectoris ad Christum, clausum, ut antea retinere. Et tamen à multis literatis tales pro fictis habebantur."
- 13 *Formicarius* 3.1, pp. 293–94: "revelationem finxit & ecstasin, quam nunquam habuit, ut mihi coram suo Superiore propria fassa est ... publice mere ficta clamare coepit voce alta & in jubilo; vel, cadendo in solum, effingere raptum vel mentis excessum."
- 14 *Formicarius* 3.1, pp. 294: "coram cunctis clamare quasi in jubilo coepit. Quae fassa est ... quod illud non ex charitatis fervore, sed tantum fecisset ex inani gloria."
- 15 *Formicarius* 3, 11, pp. 391–93: "Ostenderat autem se predicta femina saepe numero jacere, velut in ecstasi & in raptu ecstático: Ex quo reversa & expergiscens, suis postmodum secreta, quae non noverat, dicere solebat ... certa die, quae nominabatur, quinque Christi stigmatum insignia, in manibus, pedibus, & in corde feminae certitudinaliter appaerent."
- 16 *Formicarius* 2.4, p. 200; see the detailed analysis of this story by Catherine Chène in *L'imaginaire du sabbat*, pp. 204–20.
- 17 *Formicarius* 5.3, p. 547; *L'imaginaire du sabbat*, pp. 156–57; English translation in Kors and Peters 2001, p. 158.
- 18 *Formicarius* 5.7, pp. 590–95; *L'imaginaire du sabbat*, pp. 196–99, "Nec tamen credere debes, Petrum ... manibus maleficarum, quae in castro non erant, corporaliter

per gradus projectum, sed maleficarum sacrificiis vel cerimoniais allecti Daemones praesentes illud praecipitium fecerunt Petri Daemonis impressione in imaginatione malificorum factum est, ut absentia velut praesentia cernerentur."

- 19 "... *et subvertendo aliquod vas quod ponunt in circulo facto per eos in terra, ubi etiam mingit dyabolus, de quo bibunt, et demum suppinant, intencione quod sic totaliter recedunt a fide Christi ...; faciat crucem in terra in dispectu Jesu Christi ... et super crucem ter ponat pedem sinistrum et ter expuat de super et mingat et extercoret et culum nudum ostendat versus solis ortum et faciat figam cum digitis et expuendo dicat ego te renego propheta ...*" The first half of the quotation comes from the treatise *Ut magorum*, the second part from a trial staged by Tholosan in 1438; but the treatise itself also contains a very similar description. Cf. Paravy 1979, p. 355; as well as *L'imaginaire du sabbat*, pp. 365–67, 400–1. Almost the same description can be read in the sentence of a trial presided over by Tholosan in 1436 (see Marx 1914, p. 36) and a third trial in 1437 (see Hansen 1901, p. 541).
- 20 Marx 1914, p. 34: "*habebat oculos grossos, admodum oculi bovis, scintillas igneas emittentes, et habebat linguam extra hoc longam versus terram ... et habebat tibias curvas et articulos pedum nigros.*" The other references are from *ibid.*, pp. 33–36.
- 21 Hansen 1901, pp. 540–41: "*cum illo de nocte dormiebat et delectabatur et habebat rem delectabilem.*"
- 22 I have dealt in detail with the history of Hungarian witch hunts in several studies (Klaniczay 1990a and 1990b), the statistics have been further developed and completed by new published and unpublished materials in Tóth 2000.
- 23 This useful category has been elaborated by Gustav Henningsen in his analysis of Basque witchcraft persecutions (1980).
- 24 Dozens of such stories are described and analyzed in Klaniczay 1993.
- 25 For a more detailed documentation of his activities, see Klaniczay 1993, p. 243.
- 26 For a more detailed analysis of the act of "signing in" to the diabolical book, see Klaniczay and Kristóf 2001.

Bibliography

- Bailey, Michael D. (2002). *Battling Demons: Witchcraft, Heresy, and Reform in the Late Middle Ages*. University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press.
- Benedetti, Marina (1998). *Io non sono Dio. Guglielma di Milano e i Figli dello Spirito Santo*. Milano: Edizioni Libreria Francescana.
- Benz, Ernst (1969). *Die Vision: Erfahrungsformen und Bilderwelt*. Stuttgart: Klett.
- Blumenfeld-Kosinski, Renate (2006). *Poets, Saints, and Visionaries of the Great Schism 1378–1417*. University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press.
- Bozók, Edina (2003). “Le miracle et la maison du saint.” *Hortus Artium Mediaevalium* 9: 247–252.
- Burke, Peter (1978). *Popular Culture in Early Modern Europe*. London: Temple Smith.
- Bynum, Caroline Walker (1982). *Jesus as Mother: Studies in the Spirituality of the High Middle Ages*. Berkeley–Los Angeles: University of California Press.
- . (1987). *Holy Feast and Holy Fast: The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Women*. Berkeley–Los Angeles: University of California Press.
- Caciola, Nancy (2000). “Spirits Seeking Bodies: Death, Possession and Communal Memory in the Middle Ages.” In Bruce Gordon and Peter Marshall, eds., *The Place of the Dead: Death and Remembrance in Late Medieval and Early Modern Europe*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 66–86.
- . (2003). *Discerning Spirits: Divine and Demonic Possession in the Middle Ages*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Christian, William Jr. (1981). *Apparitions in Late Medieval and Renaissance Spain*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- . (1998). “Six Hundred Years of Visionaries in Spain: Those Believed and Those Ignored.” In Michael Hanagan, Leslie Page Moch, and Wayne te Brake, eds., *Challenging Authority: The Historical Study of Contentious Politics*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 107–119.
- Clark, Stuart (1980). “Inversion, Misrule and the Meaning of Witchcraft.” *Past and Present* 87: 98–127.
- . (1997). *Thinking with Demons: The Idea of Witchcraft in Early Modern Europe*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Coakley, John W. (2006). *Women, Men, and Spiritual Power: Female Saints and their Male Collaborators*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Cohn, Norman (1975). *Europe's Inner Demons: The Demonization of Christians in Medieval Christendom*. New York: Basic Books.
- Crisafulli, V. S. and J. W. Nesbitt (1997). *The Miracles of St. Artemios: A Collection of Miracle Stories by an Anonymous Author of Seventh-Century Byzantium*. Leiden: Brill.
- Csepregi, Ildikó (2007). *The Compositional History of Greek Christian Incubation Miracle Collections: Saint Thecla, Saint Cosmas and Damian, Saint Cyrus and John and Saint Artemios*. Ph.D. Diss. Central European University, Budapest.
- Davidson, Arnold (1998). “Miracles of Bodily Transformation, or How St. Francis Received the Stigmata.” In Caroline A. Jones, Peter Gallison, and Amy Slaton, eds., *Picturing Science, Producing Art*. New York: Routledge, 101–124.

- Delehay, Hippolyte (1925). "Les recueils antiques de miracles des saints." *Analecta Bollandiana* 43: 1–85; 305–325.
- Deubner, Ludwig (1900). *De Incubatione capita quattuor*. Leipzig: B.G. Teubner.
- Dinzelbacher, Peter (1981). *Vision und Visionsliteratur im Mittelalter*. Stuttgart: Hierse-
man.
- . (1995). *Heilige oder Hexen? Schicksale auffälliger Frauen in Mittelalter und Frühneuzeit*. Zurich: Artemis & Winkler.
- Edelstein, E. J. and L. Edelstein (1945). *Asclepius: A Collection of the Testimonies*. 2 vols. 2nd ed. Baltimore and London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1998.
- Elliott, Dyan (1997). "The Physiology of Rapture and Female Spirituality." In Peter Biller and A. J. Minnis, eds., *Medieval Theology and the Natural Body*. York Medieval Press – Boydell Press, Woodbridge, 141–74.
- . (2002). "Seeing Double: John Gerson, the Discernment of Spirits, and Joan of Arc." *American Historical Review* 107: 26–54.
- . (2004). *Proving Woman. Female Spirituality and Inquisitional Culture in the Later Middle Ages*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Evans-Pritchard, E. E. (1980). *Witchcraft, Oracles and Magic among the Azande*. Abridged with an Introduction by Eva Gillies. New edition, Oxford: Clarendon.
- Falvay, Dávid (2005). *A Szent Erzsébetnek tulajdonított Mária-revelációk és itáliei kontextusuk* [The Mary-revelations attributed to St. Elizabeth and their Italian context]. PhD dissertation, Eötvös Loránd University, Budapest.
- Fraioli, Deborah A. (1999). *Joan of Arc: The Early Debate*. Woodbridge: Boydell Press.
- Frugoni, Chiara (1993). *Francesco e l'invenzione delle stimmate. Una storia per parole e immagini fino a Bonaventura e Giotto*. Torino: Einaudi.
- Gecser, Ottó (2005). "Santa Elisabetta e il miracolo delle rose." In László Csorba and Gyöngyi Komlóssy, eds., *Annuario 2002–2004: Conferenze e convegni*. Rome: Accademia d'Ungheria in Roma, 240–47.
- . (2007). *Aspects of the Cult of St. Elizabeth of Hungary with a Special Emphasis on Preaching, 1235–1500*. Ph.D. thesis, Central European University, Budapest.
- Giacomo da Varazze (1998). *Legenda aurea*. Ed., Giovanni Paolo Maggioni, 2 vols. Florence: Edizioni del Galluzzo.
- Ginzburg, Carlo (1966). *I Benandanti. Stregoneria e culti agrari tra Cinquecento e Seicento*. Torino: Einaudi. (English translation: *The Night Battle: Witchcraft and Agrarian Cults in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries*. Trans. John and Anne Tedeschi. Baltimore–London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1983).
- . (1991). *Ecstasies: Deciphering the Witches' Sabbath*. Trans. by Raymond Rosenthal. New York: Pantheon.
- Giunta, Diega (1999). "La questione delle stimmate alle origini della iconografia cateriniana e la fortuna del tema nel corso dei secoli." In *Con l'occhio e col lume. Atti del corso seminariale di studi su S. Caterina da Siena. a cura di Luigi Trenti e Bente Klange Addobbo*. Siena: Cantagalli, 319–348.
- Goodich, Michael (1982). *Vita Perfecta: The Ideal of Sainthood in the Thirteenth Century*. (Monographien zur Geschichte des Mittelalters 25) Stuttgart: Hierse-
mann.

- . (2004). “The Role of Dreams in Thirteenth-Century Hagiography.” Unpublished Ms kindly shown by the author.
- . (2007). “The Role of the Dream in Thirteenth-Century Hagiography.” In Nancy Van Deusen, ed., *Procession, Performance, Liturgy, and Ritual. Essays in Honor of Bryan R. Gillingham*. Ottawa, Canada: The Institute of Mediaeval Music, 175–190.
- Hamburger, Jeffrey F. (1998). *The Visual and the Visionary: Art and Female Spirituality in Late Medieval Germany*. New York: MIT Press – Zone Books.
- Hamilton, Mary (1906). *Incubation and the Cure of Diseases in Pagan Temples and Christian Churches*. London: Henderson.
- Hansen, Joseph (1900). *Zauberwahn, Inquisition und Hexenprozess im Mittelalter und die Entstehung der großen Hexenverfolgung*. Munich–Leipzig.
- . (1901). *Quellen und Untersuchungen zur Geschichte des Hexenwahns und der Hexenverfolgung um Mittelalter*. Bonn (reprinted Hildesheim: Olms, 1963).
- Henningsen, Gustav (1980). *The Witches’ Advocate: Basque Witchcraft and the Spanish Inquisition*. Reno: University of Nevada Press.
- Herzig, Tamar (2006). “Witches, Saints, and Heretics? Heinrich Kramer’s Ties with Italian Women Mystics.” *Magic, Ritual and Witchcraft* 1: 24–55.
- Horna, Richard (1933). *Zwei Hexenprozesse in Pressburg zu Beginn des XVII. Jahrhunderts*. Bratislava, Slovenská Grafia.
- Hufford, David (1982). *The Terror that Comes in the Night*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Huyskens, Albert, ed. (1908). *Quellenstudien zur Geschichte der hl. Elisabeth*. Marburg.
- . (1911). *Der sogenannte Libellus de dictis quattor ancillarum s. Elisabeth confectus*. Munich–Kempten.
- Kieckhefer, Richard (1976). *European Witch Trials: Their Foundations in Popular and Learned Culture, 1300–1500*. Berkeley–Los Angeles: The University of California Press.
- Klaniczay, Gábor (1984). “Shamanistic Elements in Central European Witchcraft.” In Mihály Hoppál, ed., *Shamanism in Eurasia*. Göttingen: Herodot, 404–422.
- . (1990a). “The Accusations and the Popular Universe of Magic.” In Bengt Ankarloo and Gustav Henningsen, eds., *Early Modern European Witchcraft: Centres and Peripheries*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 219–255.
- . (1990b). “Witch-hunting in Hungary: Social or cultural tensions?” In Gábor Klaniczay, *The Uses of Supernatural Power: The Transformations of Popular Religion in Medieval and Early Modern Europe*. Translated by Susan Singerman, edited by Karen Margolis. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- . (1993). “Le sabbat raconté par les témoins des procès de sorcellerie en Hongrie.” In Nicole Jacques-Chaquin and Maxime Préaud, eds., *Le sabbat des sorciers XVe–XVIIIe siècles*. Grenoble: Jérôme Millon, 227–46.
- . (1997). “Miraculum and Maleficium: Reflections Concerning Late Medieval Female Sainthood.” In R. Po-Chia Hsia and R. W. Scribner, eds., *Problems in the Historical Anthropology of Early Modern Europe*. Wolfenbütteler Forschungen Bd. 78. Wiesbaden: Harrasowitz, 49–74.

- . (2002). *Holy Rulers and Blessed Princesses: Dynastic Cults in Medieval Central Europe*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.
- . (2002). “Le stigmati di santa Margherita d’Ungheria: immagini e testi.” *Iconographica. Rivista di iconografia medievale e moderna* 1: 16–31.
- . (2003). *The Process of Trance, Heavenly and Diabolic Apparitions in Johannes Nider’s Formicarius*. Collegium Budapest, Discussion Paper Series. No. 65, <http://www.colbud.hu/main/PubArchive/DP/DP65-Klaniczay.pdf>. Reprinted in Nancy Van Deusen, ed., *Procession, Performance, Liturgy, and Ritual. Essays in Honor of Bryan R. Gillingham*. Ottawa, Canada: The Institute of Mediaeval Music, 203–258.
- . (2004). “Proving sanctity in the canonization processes (Saint Elizabeth and Saint Margaret of Hungary).” In Gábor Klaniczay, ed., *Procès de canonisation au Moyen Âge—Aspects juridiques et religieux: Medieval Canonization Processes—Legal and Religious Aspects*. Rome: École française de Rome, 117–48.
- Klaniczay, Gábor and Ildikó Kristóf (2001). “Écritures saintes et pactes diaboliques. Les usages religieux de l’écrit (Moyen Âge et Temps modernes).” *Annales. Histoire, Sciences Sociales* 56, no. 4–5 (Juillet-October): 947–980.
- Klaniczay, Gábor, Ildikó Kristóf, and Éva Pócs, eds., (1989). *Magyarországi boszorkányperek. Kisebbs forráskiadványok gyűjteménye 1–2* [Hungarian witch trials: collection of smaller publications]. Budapest: MTA Néprajzi Kutató Csoport.
- Kleinberg, Aviad M. (1992). *Prophets in Their Own Country: Living Saints and the Making of Sainthood in the Later Middle Ages*. Chicago–London: The University of Chicago Press.
- Komáromy, Andor, ed., (1910). *Magyarországi boszorkányperek oklevéltára* [The Collection of Hungarian Witch-Trial Documents]. Budapest.
- Kors, Alan C. and Edward Peters, eds., (2001). *Witchcraft in Europe 1100–1700: A Documentary History*. Philadelphia: The University of Pennsylvania Press (2nd ed.).
- Lea, Henry Charles (1939). *Materials toward a History of Witchcraft*. Ed. Arthur C. Howland. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Leonardi, Claudio and Giovanni Pozzi (1988). *Scrittrici mistiche italiane*. Genova: Marietti.
- Lemmens, Leonhard (1901). “Zur Biographie der heiligen Elisabeth, Landgräfin von Thüringen.” *Mittheilungen des Historischen Vereins der Diözese Fulda* 4: 1–24.
- Lewis, Gertrud Jaron (1996). *By Women, for Women, about Women: The Sister-Books of Fourteenth-Century Germany*. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies.
- L’imaginaire du sabbat. Édition critique des textes les plus anciens (1430 c.–1440 c.)*. (1999). Martine Ostorero, Agostino Paravicini-Bagliani, Kathrin Utz Tremp, and Catherine Chêne. Cahiers lausannois d’histoire médiévale, 26: Lausanne.
- Marx, Jean (1914). *L’inquisition en Dauphiné: Étude sur le développement et la répression de l’hérésie et de la sorcellerie du XIVe siècle au début du règne de François Ier*. Paris.
- Mooney, Catherine M., ed., (1999). *Gendered Voices: Medieval Saints and their Interpreters*. Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press.

- Muchembled, Robert (1985). "L'autre côté du miroir: mythes sataniques et réalités culturelles aux XVe et XVIIIe siècles." *Annales. E.S.C.* 40: 288–306.
- Newman, Barbara (2005a). "What Did It Mean to Say 'I Saw'? The Clash Between Theory and Practice in Medieval Visionary Culture." *Speculum* 80: 1–43.
- . (2005b). "A Heretic Saint?" *Church History* 74: 1, 1–38.
- Nider, Johannes (2005). *Les Sorciers et leurs tromperies: "La fourmilière," livre V*. Ed. and trans. Jean Céard. Grenoble: Jérôme Millon.
- Oliger, Livarius (1926–27). "Revelationes B. Elisabeth. Disquisitio critica una cum textibus latino et catalaunensi." *Antonianum* 1: 24–83; 2: 483 ff.
- Paravy, Pierrette (1993). *De la chrétienté romaine à la réforme en Dauphiné: Évêques, fidèles et déviants (vers 1340–1530)*. 2 vols. Rome: École française de Rome.
- . (1979). "A propos de la genèse médiévale des chasses aux sorcières: Le traité de Claude Tholosan, juge dauphinois (vers 1436)." *Mélanges de l'école française de Rome* 91: 333–79.
- Petroff, Elizabeth Alvilda (1986). *Medieval Women's Visionary Literature*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Pócs, Éva (1989). *Fairies and Witches at the Boundary of South-Eastern and Central Europe*. Folklore Fellows' Communications N. 243. Helsinki: Academia Scientiarum Fennica.
- . (1999). *Between the Living and the Dead: A Perspective on Witches and Seers in the Early Modern Age*. Trans. Sz. Rédey and M. Webb. Budapest: Central European University Press.
- Reizner, János (1900). *Szeged története* IV. [The History of Szeged]. Szeged.
- Rener, Monika, ed., (1993). *Die Vita der heiligen Elisabeth des Dietrich von Apolda*. Veröffentlichungen der Historischen Kommission für Hessen 53. Marburg: Elwert.
- Roper, Lyndal (1992). "Witchcraft and Fantasy in Early Modern Germany." *History Workshop Journal*, 19–43.
- . (2004). *Witch Craze: Terror and Fantasy in Baroque Germany*. New Haven and London: Yale University Press.
- Rowland, Robert (1990). "Fantasticall and Devilshe Persons': European Witch-Beliefs in Comparative Perspective." In Bengt Ankarloo and Gustav Henningsen, eds., *Early Modern Witchcraft: Centres and Peripheries*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 161–91.
- Rusconi, Roberto (1999). *Profezia e profeti alla fine del Medioevo*. Roma: Viella.
- Sankt Elisabeth. Fürstin Dienerin Heilige*. (1981). Sigmaringen: Thorbecke.
- Schmucki, Octavian (1991). *The Stigmata of St. Francis of Assisi: A Critical Investigation in the Light of Thirteenth-Century Sources*. New York: The Franciscan Institute, St. Bonaventure University.
- Schram, Ferenc, ed., (1970). *Magyarországi boszorkányperek (1529–1768)*. Vols. I–II [Hungarian Witch-Trials 1529–1768]. Budapest: Akadémiai Kiadó.
- . (1982). *Magyarországi boszorkányperek (1529–1768)*. Vol. III [Hungarian Witch-Trials 1529–1768]. Budapest: Akadémiai Kiadó.
- Sigal, Pierre-André (1985). *L'homme et le miracle dans la France médiévale (XI–XII siècle)*. Paris: Édition du Cerf.

- Simons, Walter (1994). "Reading a Saint's Body: Rapture and Bodily Movement in the *vitae* of Thirteenth-century Beguines." In Sarah Kay and Miri Rubin, eds., *Framing Medieval Bodies*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 10-23.
- Simons, Walter and Joanna E. Ziegler (1990). "Phenomenal Religion in the Thirteenth Century and its Image: Elisabeth Spalbeek and the Passion cult." In W. J. Sheils and D. Wood, eds., *Women in the Church*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 117-126.
- Soldan, Wilhelm Gottlieb (1843). *Geschichte der Hexenprozesse*. Bearbeitet in 1880 von Heinrich Heppe. Neu bearb. und hrsg. von Max Bauer. [3. Aufl.]. Munich: Müller. 1-2 (1911).
- Switek, Günter (1972). "'Discretio spirituum': Ein Beitrag zur Geschichte der Spiritualität." *Theologie und Philosophie* 47: 36-76.
- Taussig, Michael (1998). "Viscerality, Faith, and Skepticism: Another Theory of Magic." In Nicholas B. Dirks, ed., *In Near Ruins: Cultural Theory at the End of the Century*. Minneapolis-London: University of Minnesota Press, 221-56.
- Tóth, G. Péter (2000). *A magyarországi boszorkányság forrásainak katasztere (1408-1848)* [Register of the sources of witchcraft in Hungary between 1408-1848]. Budapest-Veszprém: MTA Néprajzi Kutatóintézete - Laczkó Dezső Múzeum.
- Tschacher, Werner (1999). "Der Flug durch die Luft zwischen Illusionstheorie und Realitätsbeweis: Studien zum sog. Kanon Episkopi und zum Hexenflug." *Zeitschrift der Savigny-Stiftung zur Rechtsgeschichte* 116, Kan. Abt. 85: 225-76.
- . (2000). *Der Formicarius des Johannes Nider von 1437: Studien zu den Anfängen der europäischen Hexenverfolgungen im Spätmittelalter*. Aachen: Shaker.
- Vauchez, André (1968). "Les stigmates de Saint François et leurs détracteurs dans les derniers siècles du moyen âge." *Mélanges de l'École Française de Rome* 80: 595-625.
- . (1981). *La sainteté en Occident aux derniers siècles du moyen âge. D'après les procès de canonisation et les documents hagiographiques*. Rome: École française de Rome.
- . (1986). "Jacques de Voragine et les saints du XIIIe s. dans la *Légende dorée*." In Brenda Dunn-Lardreau, ed., *Legenda Aurea: Sept siècles de diffusion*. Actes du colloque ... 11-13 mai 1983. Montréal-Paris: Vrin-Bellarmin, 27-56.
- . ed. (1990). *Les textes prophétiques et la prophétie en Occident (XIIe-XVIe siècle) et la prophétie en Occident (XIIIe-XVIe siècle)*. Rome: École française de Rome.
- Voaden, Rosalyn (1999). *God's Words, Women's Voices: The Discernment of Spirits in the Writing of Late-Medieval Women Visionaries*. Woodbridge: Boydell.
- Wendel-Widmer, Barbara Ruth (1987). *Die Wunderheilungen am Grabe der Heiligen Elisabeth von Thüringen. Eine medizinhistorische Untersuchung*. Zurich: Juris.
- Würth, Ingrid (2005-06). "Die Aussagen der vier Dienerinnen im Kanonisationsverfahren Elisabeths von Thüringen (1235) und ihre Überlieferung im Libellus." *Zeitschrift des Vereins für Thüringische Geschichte* 59-60: 7-74.
- Zarri, Gabriella (1990). *Le sante vive. Profezie di corte e devozione femminile tra '400 e '500*. Torino: Rosenberg & Sellier.